Policy Pathways for States under the Clean Power Plan

JENNIFER MACEDONIA
IMPLEMENTATION OPTIONS FOR EPA’S PROPOSED CLEAN POWER PLAN:
A MIDCONTINENT STATES REGIONAL WORKSHOP
DETROIT, MICHIGAN
JUNE 5, 2015
State Plans

Flexibility included in the Clean Power Plan gives states choices and specific decision points for writing 111(d) plans.

What are key objectives?
Threshold decisions?
Policy options?
What are key objectives for a 111(d) plan?

- Cost effective
- Flexibility for regulated entities
- Simplicity and ease of implementation
- Limit federal involvement in state energy decisions
- Preserve the option to connect to other states
- Recognize unique state circumstances

- Maintain reliability
- Maintain fuel diversity
- Achieve the environmental goal
- Regulatory certainty (for regulated entities and economic regulators)
- Capture reductions from all activities
- Consistency with electricity system
Threshold Decisions

• Rate or mass-based approach?

• What entities are to be regulated?

• How much flexibility?

• Trading or no trading?

• Allow power plant owners to use credits or allowances from other states?
# Overview of Policy Pathways

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regulated Entities?</th>
<th>Rate-based</th>
<th>Mass-based</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Covered power plants &amp; other entities</td>
<td>State Portfolio/Commitment Approach</td>
<td>State Portfolio/Commitment Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities and other covered power plants</td>
<td>Utility Rate Approach</td>
<td>Utility Mass Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Utility Rate Approach w/ Optional Trading</td>
<td>Utility Budget Approach w/ Optional Trading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plant/Unit Level</td>
<td>Full Rate-based Trading</td>
<td>Full Mass-based Trading</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Utility Rate Approach

Utility or other power plant owner meets the rate-based goal on average for its entire fleet, adjusting for qualifying renewable generation and end-use energy efficiency.

**Utility fleet average emission rate = state goal (lbs CO₂/MWh)**

- Generation-weighted average emission rate
- Adjustments for qualifying zero carbon generation and energy efficiency
Utility Mass Approach

Utility or other power plant owner meets it’s mass-based emissions overall for its entire fleet

Utility fleet emissions = portion of state mass goal (tons CO₂)

Add up emissions for all units in the fleet

No adjustments for zero carbon generation and energy efficiency because produces no CO₂
Rate- and Mass-based Flexibility Mechanisms (trading)

**Rate-Based**
Generators must acquire credits if they exceed the emission rate goal (state goal rate).

Credits:
- extend the concept of averaging emission rates to allow flexibility in where emission reductions occur
- are created by state after verifying generation from units emitting below goal rate and zero carbon RE, EE, nuclear

**Mass-Based**
Generators must hold allowances for every ton emitted.

Allowances:
- operationalize flexibility in where emission reductions occur
- are created by the state before the start of the period to represent an authorization to emit 1 ton of CO₂ each up to the mass goal.

WWW.BIPARTISANPOLICY.ORG
Choosing a Policy Pathway for State 111(d) Plans to Meet State Objectives

By Franz Litz, Great Plains Institute and Jennifer Macedonia, Bipartisan Policy Center


1. Coming Requirements for States
2. Identifying State Objectives
3. Threshold Considerations for Choosing a 111(d) Policy Pathway
   - Rate vs. mass
   - Who will be regulated?
   - How much flexibility for regulated entities?
4. Available State Plan Approaches
5. Policy Straw Men